

STUDY MATERIALS: Catholic Modernism

James Hitchcock, Ph.D.

Terms of Use. Catholic Thinkers media is copyrighted material. However, we have made it free with the expectation that it will be shared and used by many. If you share what you see here, please acknowledge your source, and send people our way to find more. You or your organization may not benefit financially from use of our media without written consent. Please [continue reading](#) for full terms of use, and contact us with questions or requests: info@catholicthinkers.org

Contents

1. [The Nature of Modernity I](#)
2. [The Nature of Modernity II](#)
3. [The Church and Modernity I](#)
4. [The Church and Modernity II](#)
5. [Alfred Loisy](#)
6. [George Tyrrell](#)
7. [Baron Von Hugel](#)
8. [Other Modernists](#)
9. [Americanism](#)
10. [Modernism in America](#)
11. [Condemnation](#)
12. [Aftermath](#)

Lesson 1: The Nature of Modernity I

Subjects

- The meaning of Modernity
- Its origins

- Chief elements of Modernity

Suggested Readings

- Willson H. Coates, Hayden V. White, and J. Salwyn Shapiro, *The Emergence of Liberal Humanism* (two volumes)
- John U. Nef, *Western Civilization since the Renaissance*
- Jacques Maritain, *Three Reformers*
- John H. Randall, *The Making of the Modern Mind*

Suggestions for Review

1. How can modernity be defined? How does the modern mind differ from earlier ages?
2. When does modernity begin and what caused it? Justify your answer in terms of the particular criteria you identify as defining modernity.

Lesson 2: The Nature of Modernity II

Subjects

- Modernity as anti-religious
- The New Science
- Enlightenment
- French Revolution
- Revolutionary movements

Suggested Readings

- Owen Chadwick, *The Secularization of the European Mind in the 19th Century*
- Coates, et al., *Emergence*
- Paul Johnson, *Modern Times*

- _____, *The Birth of the Modern*
- Peter Gay, *The Enlightenment*, Vol. I
- Randall, *Making*
- Thomas P. Neill, *Makers of the Modern Mind*

Suggestions for Review

1. Why did modernity develop in ways inimical to religion?
 2. What is Modernism, understood in a secular social and cultural sense?
 3. Discuss the cultural situation the 19th century, in which there was both a return to religion and an increasingly intense attack on religion.
-

Lesson 3: The Church and Modernity I

Subjects

- The Catholic (Counter) Reformation
- Assaults on the Church
- Enlightenment skepticism

Suggested Readings

- H. Outram Evennett, *The Spirit of the Counter Reformation*
- Marvin O'Connell, *The Counter-Reformation*
- Roger Aubert, *The Church in a Secularized Society*
- John McManners, *The Church and the French Revolution*
- R.R. Palmer, *Catholics and Unbelievers 18th-Century France*
- Henri Daniel-Rops, *The Church in the 18th Century*
- _____, *The Church in an Age of Revolution*

- Jean Delumeau, Catholicism between Luther and Voltaire

Suggestions for Review

1. What impact did the Protestant Reformation have on the spiritual state of Europe? In what ways did it help usher in the modern world?
 2. How did the Catholic Church respond to the Reformation?
 3. Was the Scientific Revolution anti-religious?
 4. How did the New Science permanently alter the intellectual outlook of the West?
-

Lesson 4: The Church and Modernity II

Subjects

- Liberalism
- Blessed Pius IX and modernity
- First Vatican Council
- Liberal Catholicism
- Leo XIII

Suggested Readings

- Aubert, Church in Secularized Society
- McManners, Church and French Revolution
- Palmer, Catholics and Unbelievers
- Warren Carroll, The Guillotine and the Cross
- Raymond Corrigan, The Church in the 19th Century
- E.E.Y. Hales, *Pio Nono*
- _____, The Catholic Church in the Modern World

- Joseph Altholz, *The Liberal Catholic Movement*
- Bernard M.G. Reardon, *Liberalism and Tradition: Aspects of Catholic Thought in 19th-Century France*
- Hubert Jedin, *The Church in the Modern Age*
- Daniel-Rops, *A Fight for God*

Suggestions for Review

1. Why was the Enlightenment anti-religious?
 2. How did the Church respond to the Enlightenment and the French Revolution?
 3. What factors led to a religious revival in the 19th century, even as modernity became increasingly secular and anti-religious?
 4. How did popes and other Catholic leaders in the 19th century respond to modernity?
 5. What was "liberal Catholicism" in the 19th century?
-

Lesson 5: Alfred Loisy

Subjects

- New biblical criticism
- Historical consciousness
- Meaning of Tradition
- Religious experience

Suggested Readings

- Alfred Loisy, *The Gospel and the Church*
- _____, *My Duel with the Vatican*
- Francesco Turvasi, *The Condemnation of Alfred Loisy and the Historical Method*

- Marvin O'Connell, *Critics on Trial: an Introduction to the Modernist Crisis*
- Gabriel Daly, *Transcendence and Immanence, Studies in Catholic Modernism and Integralism*
- Thomas Michael Loome, *Liberal Catholicism, Reform Catholicism, Modernism*
- Bernard M.G. Reardon, *Roman Catholic Modernism*
- John Ratte, *Three Modernists*
- Michele Ranchetti, *The Catholic Modernists*
- Alec Vidler, *A Variety of Catholic Modernists*
- Darrell Jodock, *Catholicism contending with Modernity*

Suggestions for Review

1. What intellectual and personal factors caused Loisy to move away from Catholic orthodoxy?
2. What were his attitudes towards Protestantism?
3. What were his attitudes towards the traditions of the Catholic Church?
4. Compare and contrast his approach to doctrine with that of Cardinal John Henry Newman, especially in the latter's *Essay on the Development of Doctrine*.
5. To what extent was the thought of Loisy included in the condemnations of St. Pius X? (Found in Reardon, *Roman Catholic Modernism*, and other places).
6. What is meant by "historical consciousness" and how did it affect Loisy's thought?
7. What is meant by "religious experience" and how did it affect his thought?

Lesson 6: George Tyrrell

Subjects

- Rejection of Thomism

- Religious experience
- Dogma as guide to practice
- Anti-papalism

Suggested Readings

- O'Connell, *Critics*
- Daly, *Transcendence*
- Loome, *Liberal Catholicism*
- Reardon, *Catholic Modernism*
- Ratte, *Three Modernists*
- Ranchetti, *Modernists*
- Vidler, *Variety*
- Tyrrell, *Christianity at the Crossroads*
- Nicholas Sagovsky, "On God's Side": The Life of George Tyrrell
- David G. Schultenover, *George Tyrrell*
- Maude Petre, *Autobiography and Life of George Tyrrell*
- Ellen Leonard, *George Tyrrell and the Catholic Tradition*
- Jodock, *Catholicism*

Suggestions for Review

1. What intellectual and personal factors caused Tyrrell to move away from Catholic orthodoxy?
2. What were his attitudes towards Protestantism?
3. What were his attitudes towards the traditions of the Catholic Church?
4. Compare and contrast his approach to doctrine with that of Cardinal John Henry Newman, especially in the latter's *Essay on the Development of Doctrine*.
5. To what extent was Tyrrell's thought included in the condemnations of St. Pius X? (Found in Reardon, *Roman Catholic Modernism*, and other places).

6. What is meant by "historical consciousness" and how did it affect Tyrrell's thought?
 7. What is meant by "religious experience" and how did it affect his thought?
-

Lesson 7: Baron Von Hugel

Subjects

- Biblical criticism
- Experience of transcendence
- Mysticism

Suggested Readings

- O'Connell, *Critics*
- Daly, Transcendence
- Loome, Liberal Catholicism
- Reardon, Catholic Modernism
- Ratte, Three Modernists
- Ranchetti, Catholic Modernists
- Vidler, *Variety*
- Friedrich von Hugel, The Mystical Element of Religion as Studied in St. Catherine of Genoa and Her Friends
- Joseph P. Whelan, The Spirituality of Baron Friedrich von Hugel
- Michael de la Bedoyere, *The Life of Baron von Hugel*
- John J. Heaney, The Modernist Crisis: von Hugel
- Lawrence F. Barmann, Baron Friedrich von Hugel and the Modernist Crisis

Suggestions for Review

1. How did the new biblical criticism influence von Hugel?
 2. Should he be called a Modernist in the full sense?
-

Lesson 8: Other Modernists

Subjects

Maurice Blondel

- "Action"
- Longing for God
- Religious experience
- Church as mystical community

Henri Bremond

- Friendship with Modernists
- History of spirituality
- Rejection of Thomism

Maude Petre

- Friendship with Modernists

Biblical Studies

- Marie-Joseph Lagrange
- Ecole Biblique
- Providentissimus Deus

Suggested Readings

- O'Connell, *Critics*

- Daly, Transcendence
- Loome, Liberal Catholicism
- Reardon, Catholic Modernism
- Ratte, Three Modernists
- Ranchetti, Catholic Modernists
- Vidler, *Variety*
- Henri Bouillard, Blondel and Christianity
- Jean Lacroix, *Maurice Blondel*
- Henri Bremond, A Literary History of Religious Thought in France
- Henry Hogarth, *Henri Bremond*
- Clyde Crews, English Catholic Modernism: Maude Petre and the Way of Faith
- Ellen Leonard, Unresting Transformation: the Theology and Spirituality of Maude Petre
- James T. Burtchaell, Catholic Theories of Biblical Inspiration since 1810
- Jodock, *Catholicism*

Suggestions for Review

1. How did the new biblical criticism influence the people called Modernists?
2. What role did Bremond play in the Modernist crisis?
3. In what ways did spirituality, especially mysticism, serve as a means of "transcending" some of the theological issues of the day?
4. What did Blondel mean by "action"? Was he a Modernist?
5. What role did Maude Petre play in the Modernist crisis?

Lesson 9: Americanism

Subjects

- American culture
- Americanism
- Papal warnings
- Liberal bishops
- Catholic University of America

Suggested Readings

- R. Scott Appleby, "Church and Age Unite": the Modernist Impulse in American Catholicism
- Thomas T. McAvoy, The Great Crisis in American Catholic History
- Robert D. Cross, The Emergence of Liberal Catholicism in America
- Gerald P. Fogarty, The Vatican and the Americanist Crisis

Suggestions for Review

1. What was the situation of Catholics in the United States at the end of the 19th century?
2. In what sense were some of the American bishops of the time "liberals"?
3. How did they think the Church ought to accommodate itself to the American situation?
4. How did Leo XIII view the situation?

Lesson 10: Modernism in America

Subjects

William Sullivan

- Gospel as morality
- Pragmatism
- Biblical criticism
- Americanism
- Unitarianism

New York Review

- Center of new theology

John R. Slattery

- Racial justice
- Biblical criticism

Suggested Readings

- Appleby, "Church and Age"
- McAvoy, *Great Crisis*
- Cross, *Emergence*
- Ratte, *Three Modernists*
- Fogarty, *Vatican*
- _____, *American Catholic Biblical Scholarship*

Suggestions for Review

1. Discuss the career of William Sullivan in the light of the Americanist movement.
2. How did the new biblical criticism influence scholars in the United States?
3. Was there a relationship between Americanism and Modernism?

Lesson 11: Condemnation

Subjects

- Condemnations by St. Pius X
- Anti-Modernist oath
- Enforcement
- Benedict XV

Suggested Readings

- O'Connell, *Critics*
- Daly, *Transcendence*
- Loome, *Liberal Catholicism*
- Ranchetti, *Catholic Modernists*
- Vidler, *Variety*
- Schultenover, *A View from Rome: On the Eve of the Modernist Crisis* Marie C. Buehrle, Rafael Cardinal Merry del Val
- Lester Kurtz, *The Politics of Heresy*
- Gerald A. McCool, *From Unity to Pluralism: The Internal Evolution of Thomism*
- W. H. Peters, *The Life of Benedict XV*
- Anthony J. Mioni (ed.), *The Popes against Modern Errors*
- Jodock, *Catholicism*

Suggestions for Review

1. Delineate one of the following themes as expressed in St. Pius X's encyclicals condemning Modernism: denial of transcendence, materialism, perversion of spirituality, denial of authority, influence of modern culture.
2. What did St. Pius X mean in calling modernism the "summation of all heresies"?

3. Discuss the enforcement of the condemnation of Modernism.
-

Lesson 12: Aftermath

Subjects

- Catholic intellectual revival
- Did Modernism survive?
- Fallacies of Modernism

Suggested Readings

- Gerald A. McCool, *From Unity to Pluralism: The Internal Evolution of Thomism*
- Works of various 20th-century Catholic thinkers -- Maritain, Gilson, Dawson, DeLubac, Danielou, Balthasar, etc.

Suggestions for Review

1. Discuss the claim that the condemnation of Modernism blighted the intellectual life of the Church for decades.
2. How did orthodox Catholic intellectuals come to terms with the issues raised by the Modernists?
3. In what ways did the Second Vatican Council come to terms with those issues?
4. Is present-day dissenting Catholic theology a direct descendent of Modernism?